

**Comparison of the Dick and Carey and ADDIE Instructional
Design Models in Islamic Religious Education Learning**

**Latifa Khusnul Fatikhah¹, Muhammad Aliy Madani², M. Rizwal Fazar³, Sisca
Yolanda Aulia⁴, Winda Yanti⁵, Rahmad Hulbat⁶**

STIT Syekh Muhammad Nafis Tabalong, Kalimantan Selatan, Indonesia¹, STIT
Syekh Muhammad Nafis Tabalong, Kalimantan Selatan, Indonesia², STIT Syekh
Muhammad Nafis Tabalong, Kalimantan Selatan, Indonesia³, STIT Syekh
Muhammad Nafis Tabalong, Kalimantan Selatan, Indonesia⁴, STIT Syekh
Muhammad Nafis Tabalong, Kalimantan Selatan, Indonesia⁵, STAI Al-Washliyah
Barabai, Kalimantan Selatan, Indonesia⁶

latifakhusnul.f02@gmail.com¹, anakwayau@gmail.com²,
muhammadrizwal00z@gmail.com³, siscayolanda2004@gmail.com⁴,
wy4596664@gmail.com⁵, rahmad.hulbat@gmail.com⁶

Abstract

This research is motivated by the importance of using systematic instructional design models to improve the effectiveness of the learning process in Islamic Religious Education (PAI). In practice, educators need a model that can help them design learning in a structured manner so that learning objectives can be achieved optimally. Two models that are often used in instructional development are the Dick and Carey model and the ADDIE model. Both are known as systematic models, yet they have different stages and characteristics in their application to PAI learning. Based on this background, the focus of this study is to compare the Dick and Carey instructional design model and the ADDIE model in Islamic Religious Education learning. This study aims to identify the steps of the Dick and Carey model, the steps of the ADDIE model, their similarities and differences, as well as the strengths and weaknesses of each model in their application to PAI learning. The research method used is qualitative research with a library research approach. The data were obtained from various literature sources such as books, scientific journals, and articles relevant to the Dick and Carey and ADDIE instructional design models. The data were then analyzed using a descriptive-comparative method to identify the characteristics, similarities, and differences between the two models. The results of the study indicate that the Dick and Carey model has ten detailed and systematic steps that can help teachers design learning in a structured and in-depth manner. Meanwhile, the ADDIE model has five main stages Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation which are simpler and more flexible to apply. Both models share similarities in their systematic approach but differ in the level of detail of the steps and the flexibility of their implementation in PAI learning.

Keyword: Instructional Design Model, Dick and Carey, ADDIE, Islamic Religious Education.

Abstrak

Penelitian ini dilatarbelakangi oleh pentingnya penggunaan model desain pembelajaran yang sistematis dalam meningkatkan efektivitas proses pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI). Dalam praktiknya, pendidik memerlukan model yang mampu

membantu merancang pembelajaran secara terstruktur agar tujuan pembelajaran dapat tercapai secara optimal. Dua model yang sering digunakan dalam pengembangan pembelajaran adalah model Dick and Carey dan model ADDIE. Keduanya dikenal sebagai model yang sistematis, namun memiliki tahapan dan karakteristik yang berbeda dalam penerapannya pada pembelajaran PAI. Berdasarkan latar belakang tersebut maka fokus penelitian ini adalah membandingkan model desain pembelajaran Dick and Carey dan ADDIE dalam pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui langkah-langkah model Dick and Carey, langkah-langkah model ADDIE, persamaan dan perbedaannya, serta kelebihan dan kekurangan masing-masing model dalam penerapannya pada pembelajaran PAI. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah penelitian kualitatif dengan pendekatan studi pustaka (library research). Data diperoleh dari berbagai sumber literatur seperti buku, jurnal ilmiah, dan artikel yang relevan dengan model desain pembelajaran Dick and Carey dan ADDIE. Data kemudian dianalisis secara deskriptif-komparatif untuk mengidentifikasi karakteristik, kesamaan, serta perbedaan kedua model tersebut. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa model Dick and Carey memiliki sepuluh langkah yang rinci dan sistematis sehingga mampu membantu guru merancang pembelajaran secara terstruktur dan mendalam. Sementara itu, model ADDIE memiliki lima tahapan utama yaitu Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, dan Evaluation yang lebih sederhana serta fleksibel untuk diterapkan. Kedua model memiliki persamaan dalam pendekatan yang sistematis, tetapi berbeda pada tingkat kerincian langkah dan fleksibilitas penerapannya dalam pembelajaran PAI.

Kata Kunci: Model Desain pembelajaran, Dick and Carey, ADDIE, Pendidikan Agama Islam.

Introduction

Education is a platform used to develop human resources, because awareness of all aspects of life is higher if a person is educated. The national education system law states that education plays a role in developing capabilities and shaping the character and civilization of a dignified nation in order to educate the life of the nation, develop the potential of children to become people who believe in and fear God Almighty, have noble character, are healthy, knowledgeable, capable, independent and become democratic and responsible citizens. (Octaviana, 2022).

In line with general educational goals, the implementation of Islamic Religious Education requires a systematic learning approach to shape students' character and behavior. Islamic Religious Education (PAI) plays a strategic role in shaping students' character, morals, and behavior. The success of PAI learning is determined not only by the teaching materials but also by the learning design implemented, as a systematic design can increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the teaching and learning process (Fauziah and Rohmah, 2024).

In practice, teachers need a learning model that provides a clear framework for designing, managing, and evaluating learning. Widely used learning design models include Dick and Carey and ADDIE. The Dick and Carey model offers a comprehensive, systematic approach, from needs analysis and goal design to material development and learning evaluation. Meanwhile, the ADDIE model provides a flexible framework encompassing five main stages: Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation, allowing it to be tailored to student characteristics

and the learning context (Mujahid et al., 2023).

Seeing the importance of both models in supporting the success of Islamic Religious Education learning, this article discusses the comparison between the Dick and Carey and ADDIE models in Islamic Religious Education learning, with a focus on the steps of each Dick and Carey and ADDIE model, the similarities and differences in their application in Islamic Religious Education learning, as well as the advantages and disadvantages of each model.

B. Theoretical Basis

Understanding Islamic Education Learning Design

Learning design is a systematic process for planning learning experiences to achieve educational goals effectively, efficiently, and meaningfully. In the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), learning design goes beyond simply compiling material; it also encompasses the spiritual, intellectual, and moral journey of students toward becoming faithful and moral individuals. Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning requires careful planning: goal setting, strategy selection, media selection, and evaluation aligned with Islamic values. Therefore, learning design serves as a "road map" to ensure the learning process does not proceed spontaneously without direction, but rather moves toward conscious and measured Islamic character formation (Suprpto and Harahap, 2024).

Furthermore, Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning design must encompass three main domains: cognitive, affective, and psychomotor, so that students not only understand religious teachings but also experience and practice them in their lives (Putriana et al., 2025). Therefore, Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning design is a key foundation for successful learning, not merely administrative. Systematic planning ensures that learning does not lose direction and truly shapes the character of faith and morals.

The Nature of Learning Design in Islamic Religious Education (PAI)

The essence of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning design lies in the integration of knowledge and values. Religious education is not merely the transfer of knowledge, but rather the process of internalizing faith. Therefore, learning must be designed contextually, humanistically, and appropriately tailored to the needs of modern learners (Suprpto and Harahap, 2024).

In practice, Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning design plays a crucial role in shaping students' morals and character, connecting religious teachings with the realities of life, and addressing the challenges of technological and social development. In other words, Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning design is not merely pedagogy, but also a process of developing holistic human beings (Sa'diah and Harahap, 2025).

Therefore, the PAI learning design is designed to be contextual and humanistic so that Islamic religious education truly forms moral individuals, not just producing students who know the teachings.

Understanding Models Learning Design

An instructional design model is a conceptual framework or scientific roadmap used to design, develop, and evaluate learning processes to achieve effective and efficient learning outcomes (Sabrina et al., 2024). In an educational context, instructional design focuses not only on teaching materials but also involves integrated

learning objectives, instructional strategies, learning media, and assessment systems (Hastutie and Ramli, 2024).

In general, a learning design model contains a systematic sequence of steps that provide direction and structure for educators in mapping the teaching and learning process scientifically. In this planning, educators not only develop materials but also consider student characteristics, the learning context, and evaluation techniques to ensure the achievement of expected competencies (Sabrina et al., 2024).

Understanding Models Dick and Carey Learning Design

The Dick and Carey learning model is a learning model developed through a systems approach. The basic components of learning system design include analysis, design, development, implementation, and evaluation. The learning system model developed by Dick and Carey consists of several components necessary to design larger learning activities. Dick and Carey incorporated cognitive and behavioral elements that emphasize student responses to presented stimuli (Octaviana, 2022).

The Dick and Carey model is a learning design model that uses a systematic approach to designing, developing, and evaluating the learning process as a whole. This approach views learning as a system consisting of several interconnected and inseparable components, such as learning objectives, student analysis, instructional strategies, and learning evaluation (Masruroh, 2023).

The Dick and Carey model also emphasizes the importance of in-depth analysis of instructional objectives and student characteristics, ensuring that each learning strategy is designed based on expected competency indicators and actual conditions in the field. Therefore, this model is often used in the development of complex learning programs that require ongoing evaluation (Akbar et al., 2024).

In its implementation, the Dick and Carey model consists of several stages, starting with identifying learning objectives, analyzing learning, and conducting formative and summative evaluations. These stages form a framework that guides learning designers in producing designs that can be systematically implemented and assessed for effectiveness based on the achievement of predetermined objectives (Octaviana, 2022).

Conceptually, this model is very relevant to be applied in the context of Islamic Religious Education because it provides a logical and measurable basis for designing learning experiences that include aspects of religious knowledge, attitudes, and skills in an integrated manner (Saputra and Anita, 2025).

Understanding Models ADDIE Learning Design

The ADDIE learning design model is a systematic framework for designing learning that is oriented towards achieving learning objectives in a planned and measurable manner. ADDIE is an acronym for five main stages, *namely Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation*. This model is considered generic because it can be applied to various subjects, educational levels, and learning media development. Conceptually, the ADDIE model is understood as a process of developing a learning system that is carried out in stages and is interconnected. Each stage does not stand alone but serves as the foundation for the next stage, resulting in effective and efficient learning. This model is used to design learning experiences that meet student needs and allows for continuous revision based on evaluation results (Rohaeni, 2020).

In educational development studies, ADDIE is also referred to as a general instructional design model because it can accommodate various learning approaches

and strategies. This model facilitates the planning, development, implementation, and evaluation of learning within a single, cohesive system, ensuring the quality of learning (Anafi et al., 2020).

Furthermore, ADDIE is an easy-to-use model because it illustrates the basic stages of a learning system. Each stage helps educators understand student needs, design materials, develop media, implement learning, and conduct continuous evaluation and improvement (Cahyadi, 2019).

C. Method

This research uses a literature review method (*library research*), which is a study collection technique sourced from library data or literature related to the relevance being studied (Ulhaq and Inayati, 2025). The data sources in this study consist of primary data and secondary data (Sugiyono, 2018). Primary data are in the form of books and scientific articles that specifically discuss the Dick and Carey and ADDIE learning design models, and their application in Islamic Religious Education learning. The focus of the study includes: 1) the steps of the Dick and Carey model in Islamic Religious Education learning, 2) the steps of the ADDIE model in Islamic Religious Education learning, 3) the similarities of the two models in Islamic Religious Education learning, 4) the differences between the two models in Islamic Religious Education learning, 5) the advantages and disadvantages of each model in supporting the effectiveness of Islamic religious learning. Secondary data were obtained from scientific journals, previous research results, educational books, and academic articles that discuss learning design, instructional strategies, and the development of Islamic Religious Education learning. After collecting library sources, the researcher conducted a selection and evaluation of these sources. This involves selecting the most relevant and authoritative sources in the context of the Dick and Carey and ADDIE learning models in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) lessons (Masruroh, 2023). Furthermore, the data collected from various sources is then analyzed in depth to identify and solve existing problems. Conclusions are drawn after a thorough analysis of the data and sources obtained from the literature (Ulhaq and Inayati, 2025).

D. Results and Discussion

Research result

Comparison of the Dick and Carey and ADDIE Learning Design Models in Islamic Religious Education Learning, including:

1. Dick and Carey Model Steps
 - a. Identifying Learning Objectives
 - b. Implementing Learning Analytics
 - c. Identifying Student Behavior and Characteristics
 - d. Formulating Specific Learning Objectives
 - e. Developing Assessment Instruments based on benchmarks
 - f. Developing Learning Strategies
 - g. Developing and Selecting Teaching Materials
 - h. Designing and Developing Formative Evaluation
 - i. Revising the Learning Program

- j. Designing and Developing Summative Evaluation
- 2. Steps of the ADDIE Model
 - a. Analysis (*Analysis*)
 - b. Planning (*Design*)
 - c. Development (*Development*)
 - d. Implementation (*Implementation*)
 - e. Evaluation (*Evaluation*)
- 3. The Second Equation of the Model in PAI Learning
 - a. Same-the same based on a systematic approach in learning
 - b. Starting with a student needs analysis is good.
 - c. Emphasis on clear learning objectives
 - d. Evaluation process to improve the quality of learning
 - e. Focus on the integration of learning components
 - f. Supporting adaptive and contextual learning processes
- 4. Differences between the Two Models in Islamic Education Learning
 - a. Number of Steps
 - b. Level of Detail
 - c. Flexibility and Weaknesses
- 5. Advantages and Disadvantages of Both Models in PAI Learning
 - a. Advantages and disadvantages of the Dick and Carey model
 - 1) Advantages
 - a) Each step is clear and easy to follow.
 - b) Organized, efficient and effective.
 - c) Have room for improvement
 - 2) Disadvantages
 - a) This design is a procedural design so it can be rigid.
 - b) This model design is a mature design so there is no room for creativity.
 - c) Difficulties in online (indirect) learning
 - b. Advantages and disadvantages of the ADDIE model
 - 1) Advantages
 - a) Simple and structured
 - b) Consists of 5 components that are interrelated and structured systematically.
 - c) The ADDIE learning model pays attention to the development of students' cognitive, affective and psychomotor domains.
 - 2) Disadvantages
 - The disadvantage of this model is that the analysis stage takes a long time.

Discussion

Comparison of the Dick and Carey and ADDIE Learning Design Models in Islamic Religious Education Learning, including:

1. Dick and Carey Model Steps

The stages developed in the Dick and Carey Model consist of 10 steps.

The following are the stages of the Dick and Carey learning design model:

a. Identifying Learning Objectives

The first step in this model is identifying learning objectives. In this phase, the planner (designer) analyzes the expected capabilities after the learning program is completed. Ideally, the right objectives will lead to the right process. Therefore, objectives need to be identified in a way that is achievable and measurable. In this case, the ability students must possess is understanding the material (Octaviana, 2022).

b. Implementing Learning Analytics

According to Dick and Carey, learning objectives need to be analyzed to identify prerequisite skills (*subordinate skills*) and the procedural steps that students must master. This analysis is important to ensure that all students have the necessary foundational skills, ensuring effective learning and achieving learning objectives (Aripin et al., 2022).

c. Identifying Student Behavior and Characteristics

This can even be done in parallel with the analysis of the skills to be taught, taking into account students' initial abilities. A proper understanding of student characteristics helps designers determine appropriate learning strategies (Magdalena et al., 2023).

d. Formulating Specific Learning Objectives

Based on the learning analysis, the designer formulates specific learning objectives that students must achieve to meet the general objectives. The formulation must take into account conditions, expected abilities, and indicators or criteria for measuring learning success (Nugraha et al., 2024).

e. Developing Assessment Instruments based on benchmarks

Designers develop evaluation tools based on benchmarks to measure student learning outcomes. Instruments must be valid, meaning they accurately measure the intended abilities, so that the test directly assesses behavior consistent with the learning objectives (Nugraha et al., 2024).

f. Developing Learning Strategies

Once the assessment tools are prepared, the designer designs a learning strategy, consisting of activities aligned with the objectives and accompanied by feedback on student performance. The strategy is then reviewed to determine the success of the process and to determine the presentation of the material and the use of learning media (Octaviana, 2022).

g. Developing and Selecting Teaching Materials

Designers select materials to help achieve learning objectives effectively. Teaching materials serve as a medium for conveying information, including textbooks, modules, audio-video, computer-based materials, multimedia, and distance learning materials (Octaviana, 2022).

h. Designing and Developing Formative Evaluation

It is used to determine the extent to which learning objectives have been

achieved. The results serve as the basis for determining whether the program will be maintained or revised, and also serve as feedback to improve the quality of learning (Aripin et al., 2022).

i. Revising the Learning Program

Based on the results of the formative assessment, various weaknesses in the program design and learning system were identified. These deficiencies were then corrected and refined to improve the quality of learning (Octaviana, 2022).

j. Designing and Developing Summative Evaluation

Unlike formative evaluation, this assessment is the final stage of Dick and Carey's instructional design. It is conducted after the program has been revised and assessed by independent experts, so it is not part of the design process. The Dick and Carey model itself is systematic, with each step interconnected in designing learning (Aripin et al., 2022).

2. Steps of the ADDIE Model

The ADDIE learning model consists of 5 steps, namely *Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, And Evaluation* (Zuhro, et al., 2022).

a. Analysis (*Analysis*)

This initial stage focuses on understanding what students need to learn. The main activities involve identifying performance issues and learning needs, then determining the competencies to be achieved. Through analysis, learning is appropriately directed to close skill gaps.

b. Planning (*Design*)

At this stage, a systematic learning plan is developed: learning objectives, activity scenarios, materials, media, and evaluation tools. The key is to create a learning "roadmap" so that the process truly addresses the needs identified in the analysis stage.

c. Development (*Development*)

The design is then translated into a tangible product. Teachers prepare (develop) comprehensive materials, media, strategies, and learning tools. The result is a ready-to-use learning resource that supports students in building knowledge and skills.

d. Implementation (*Implementation*)

The implementation stage of learning. The teacher prepares the learning environment and guides students through activities according to the plan. The focus is on ensuring that the designed strategies are effective and that gaps in student ability are minimized.

e. Evaluation (*Evaluation*)

The evaluation stage of the learning process and outcomes. This is carried out by determining criteria, selecting measurement tools, and assessing the level of success. Evaluation results serve as the basis for improving subsequent learning to increase its effectiveness.

3. The Second Equation of the Model in PAI Learning

The Dick and Carey and ADDIE models are two instructional design approaches frequently used in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teaching in Indonesia. Both emphasize a systematic process to achieve effective learning objectives, with high relevance to developing PAI students' skills (Mujahid et al., 2023).

The main similarity between the two models is that they are both systematic and systems-based, focusing on initial learning needs analysis and ongoing evaluation. They both involve identifying learning objectives, analyzing students/contexts, developing instructional strategies, and revising them based on evaluation (Febriansya et al., 2024).

In more detail, the similarities between these two models include:

- a. Same-the same based on a systematic approach in learning
Both models emphasize that learning design must be carried out systematically, with a series of planned and interrelated steps, from identifying objectives to evaluating learning outcomes. This helps Islamic Religious Education teachers develop a structured and non-random learning process, ensuring that each component supports the achievement of religious education goals.
- b. Starting with a student needs analysis
Both the ADDIE and Dick and Carey models require teachers to conduct an initial analysis of student learning needs and characteristics before designing instruction. In the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), this stage allows teachers to understand students' levels of spiritual understanding, religious background, and learning context, allowing them to adapt religious material appropriately.
- c. Emphasis on clear learning objectives
Both models place the formulation of learning objectives as a crucial foundation in designing instruction. Clear objectives help Islamic Religious Education teachers determine strategies, content, and evaluation that align with the competencies of faith, morals, and understanding of the Qur'an.-The Qur'an that is to be achieved so that the learning procedure is directed and meaningful.
- d. Evaluation process to improve the quality of learning
ADDIE and Dick and Carey are the same-The same applies to including evaluation as a crucial element in the learning development process. This evaluation provides feedback for Islamic Religious Education teachers to assess the effectiveness of learning, make improvements, and adjust instructional strategies so that students can achieve the expected religious education competencies.
- e. Focus on the integration of learning components
Although the stage structure of the two models is different (ADDIE with five phases and Dick and Carey with more steps), they are both the same.-It equally emphasizes the importance of integration between analysis, design, development, implementation, and evaluation so that each part of the learning process consistently supports each other. This pattern helps Islamic Religious Education teachers create a holistic and integrated learning experience that encompasses religious knowledge, attitudes, and skills.

f. Supporting adaptive and contextual learning processes

Because they emphasize initial analysis and continuous evaluation, both models enable Islamic Religious Education teachers to adapt learning strategies to the needs of students and the development of the current educational context, including the challenges of the digital era that demand flexibility and innovation in delivering religious material (Suprpto and Harahap, 2024).

This equation is utilized in the development of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teaching materials, such as the detailed Dick and Carey model for student skills and ADDIE for innovative curricula in madrasas. Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers can integrate both for religious character-based learning, with cyclical evaluations that ensure the achievement of faith and moral competencies. Using the equation of both models enhances the effectiveness of PAI through iterative processes, such as in-depth analysis that produces relevant instruction for Indonesian students. This supports the goals of the Independent Curriculum, where systematic instructional design helps teachers address the challenges of religious learning in the digital age (Hani et al., 2024).

4. Differences between the Two Models in Islamic Education Learning

The main differences between the Dick and Carey and ADDIE models in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning lie in the level of detail of the steps, the flexibility of the process, and the orientation of the focus. The Dick and Carey model is more detailed and procedural, while the ADDIE model is more linear and cyclical (Fauziah and Rohmah, 2024).

In more detail as follows:

a. Number of Steps

The Dick and Carey model has 10 specific steps, from goal identification to summative evaluation, making it highly detailed for Islamic Education (PAI) instructional design. In contrast, ADDIE has only five phases (Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, Evaluation), making it more concise and easier to apply to developing Islamic Education (PAI) teaching materials.

b. Level of Detail

Dick and Carey emphasize in-depth analysis such as instructional analysis and goal hierarchies, ideal for complex PAI skills such as morals and jurisprudence. ADDIE is more general and flexible, focusing on student performance-based development (*student-centered*), suitable for technology-based PAI learning innovations.

c. Flexibility and Weaknesses

Dick and Carey is rigid due to its strict procedures, with no initial trial period, and only revisions after formative testing, which can be lengthy in PAI. ADDIE is more iterative and adaptive, allowing for revisions at each stage, although less detailed than Dick and Carey (Aripin et al., 2022).

5. Advantages and Disadvantages of Both Models in PAI Learning

The Dick and Carey and ADDIE models offer unique advantages and disadvantages in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning, as they are applied in the context of Islamic religious education. This understanding helps Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers choose models that meet their needs, such as developing student skills based on religious values (Rusnawati et al., 2025).

The Dick and Carey Model's advantages include a highly structured, 10-step model, facilitating in-depth analysis of the objectives, students, and context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), making it effective for learning complex skills such as morality and jurisprudence. Its systematic approach encourages iterative formative evaluation, improving the quality of instruction and its relevance to the Independent Curriculum (Kurikulum Merdeka) in madrasas. The Dick and Carey Model's disadvantages include its rigid, sequential process, lacking flexibility, making it time-consuming and less adaptable to changes in the dynamic context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning. There are no explicit guidelines for initial trials, potentially hindering rapid innovation in the Islamic Religious Education classroom (Fauziah and Rohmah, 2024).

ADDIE's advantages are its five iterative phases (*Analysis-Design-Development-Implementation-Evaluation*) is flexible and efficient, ideal for developing Islamic Religious Education (PAI) technology media such as digital teaching materials. A continuous evaluation cycle allows for rapid revision, supporting student-centered learning in the digital age. Disadvantages of ADDIE: Lack of detail in the analysis of the hierarchy of objectives, potentially overlooking complex nuances of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), such as the integration of Islamic faith and values. Its general orientation makes it less specific for in-depth evaluation than procedural models (Hidayat and Nizar, 2021).

In more detail, the advantages and disadvantages of the Dick and Carey and ADDIE models are:

a. Advantages and disadvantages of the Dick and Carey model

1) Advantages

- a) Each step is clear and easy to follow. The steps in this model are simple, logical steps, meaning that design is the direction and way most people think about achieving a goal or program.
- b) Organized, efficient, and effective. The steps outlined in each phase save designers from multiple interpretations, allowing every designer to go through the same sequence. Compare this to the circular model, which allows designers to choose the steps that are feasible. Furthermore, the sequence is detailed, and the model is one-way, clear, and efficient.
- c) Although this is a procedural phase, the model still has room for improvement, especially in phase 9. There are revisions in *learning analytics*, allows for correction if an error occurs and can immediately make changes to the learning analysis, before the error affects the error in the next component.

2) Disadvantages

- a) This design is a procedural design, meaning that the designer must go through the specified stages, so that the Dick and Carey learning design model seems rigid, because each step has been determined.
- b) This model design is a mature design, meaning that it does not provide space for trials and revision activities are only carried out after a formative test is held.
- c) If learning uses an internet-based and interactive model, where teachers don't meet their students directly, except for interactions

with one or two students, this model will face difficulties, especially when analyzing student characteristics (Octaviana, 2022).

b. Advantages and disadvantages of the ADDIE model

1) Advantages

- a) The ADDIE learning model is simple and systematically structured, so this design model will be easy for educators to learn.
- b) The ADDIE model consists of five interrelated and systematically structured components. This means that the first through the fifth stages must be implemented systematically. They cannot be arranged randomly, nor can we choose which ones we want to prioritize. These five stages/steps are very simple compared to other design models.
- c) The ADDIE learning model pays attention to the development of students' cognitive, affective and psychomotor domains, is consistent and reliable, meaning it cannot be changed and can be trusted, is interdependent on each other, so that there are no separate elements from the system.

2) Disadvantages

The drawback of this model is that the analysis phase is time-consuming. In this analysis phase, designers/educators are expected to first analyze two components of the student, dividing the analysis into two: performance analysis and needs analysis. These two components will ultimately influence the length of the student analysis process before the learning phase begins. These two components are crucial because they will influence the subsequent learning design phase (Zuhro et al., 2022).

Conclusion

The Dick and Carey and ADDIE learning design models play a crucial role in enhancing the effectiveness of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning. Based on the five indicators discussed, both models exhibit distinct yet complementary characteristics in systematic learning design. First, the Dick and Carey model comprises ten detailed stages, starting from identifying learning objectives to summative evaluation. This model emphasizes in-depth analysis of objectives, learner characteristics, learning strategies, and a continuous evaluation process. These detailed steps provide clear guidance for educators in designing structured and measurable learning. Second, the ADDIE model has five main stages: Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation. This model is simpler and more flexible, making it easy to apply in various learning situations. These stages enable educators to systematically design and develop learning while providing room for adjustments to learner needs. Third, the similarities between the two models lie in their systematic approach to the learning process. Both emphasize analyzing learner needs, formulating clear objectives, developing learning strategies, and evaluating as a means of improving the learning process. Fourth, the differences between the two models are evident in the number of stages, the level of detail, and the flexibility of their application. Dick and Carey is more detailed but tends to be procedural, while ADDIE is more concise and adaptive. Fifth, in terms of advantages and disadvantages, Dick and Carey excels in in-depth analysis but requires more time, while ADDIE is simpler and more flexible, although the analysis phase can be quite time-consuming. Therefore, both models can be selected and adapted to the needs of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning.

REFERENCES

- Akbar, A., dkk. (2024). "Komparasi Desain Pengembangan Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Model Jerrold E. Kemp, Walter Dick dan Lou Carey serta I Nyoman Sudana Degeng." *Equilibrium: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 12(3).
- Anafi, K., dkk. (2021). "Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Model ADDIE Menggunakan Software Unity 3D." *Jurnal Education and Development*, 9(4).
- Aripin, Z. F., dkk. (2022). "Desain Pembelajaran Model Dick and Carey Pada Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam." *Gunung Djati Conference Series*, 10.
- Cahyadi, R. A. H. (2019). "Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Berbasis ADDIE Model." *Halaqa: Islamic Education Journal*, 3(1).
- Fauziah, E., dan Rohmah, U. S. (2024). "Pengembangan Materi dan Bahan Ajar PAI Dengan Model Dick And Carey." *SSA*, 2(1).
- Febriansya, W. T., dkk. (2024). "Potret Implementasi Teori Dick and Carey dalam Penyusunan Modul Ajar PAI di SMPN 1 Siman." *Muaddib*, 2(2).
- Hani, D., dkk. (2024). "Model Pembelajaran Dick and Carey dalam Meningkatkan Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di SMAN 2 Indramayu." *Journal Islamic Pedagogia*, 4(2).
- Harahap, N., dan Sa'diah, H. (2025). "Desain Materi dan Pengembangan Pembelajaran PAI." *Jurnal Riset dan Inovasi Pembelajaran*, 5(1).
- Hastutie, G., dan Ramli, M. (2024). "Desain Pembelajaran (Model Dick & Carey, Jerold E. Kemp, dkk)." *An-Nashr: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan dan Sosial Kemasyarakatan*, 2(1).
- Hidayat, F., dan Nizar, M. (2021). "Model ADDIE (Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation and Evaluation) dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam." *JIPAI: Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 1(1).
- Magdalena, I., dkk. (2023). "Model Pembelajaran Dick and Carrey dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa dan Sastra Indonesia di SDN Pondok Jagung Timur Kota Tangerang Selatan." *Tsaqofah: Jurnal Penelitian Guru Indonesia*, 3(3).
- Masruroh, D. (2023). "Model Pembelajaran Dick and Carey dan Implementasinya Dalam Pelajaran PAI." *Global Education Journal*, 1(2).
- Mujahid, U., dkk. (2023). "Model Dick Carrey dalam Pembelajaran PAI untuk Mewujudkan Siswa Berkarakter Religius." *Jurnal Review Pendidikan dan Pengajaran*, 6(4).
- Nugraha, M. S., dkk. (2024). "Implementasi Model Dick and Carey dalam Pengembangan Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di Sekolah Dasar." *At-Tarhami: Jurnal Kajian Kependidikan Islam*, 9(1).
- Octaviana, D. R., dkk. (2024). "Model Pembelajaran Dick and Carey serta Implementasinya dalam Pembelajaran PAI." *Jurnal Tawadhu*, 6(2).
- Putriana, A., dkk. (2025). "The Design Development of Islamic Religious Education Learning Based on Bloom's Taxonomy and the Dick & Carey Model." *Indonesian Journal of Educational Research*.
- Rohaeni, S., dan Cahyadi, R. A. H. (2020). "Pengembangan Sistem Pembelajaran dalam Implementasi Kurikulum 2013 Menggunakan Model ADDIE pada Anak Usia Dini." *Jurnal Instruksional*, 1(2).
- Sabrina, N. S., dkk. (2024). "Konsep Perencanaan Pembelajaran dan Model Pengembangan Perangkat Desain Pembelajaran." *Karimah Taubid*, 3(4).

Ar-Rayyan: Journal of Islamic Education
Volume 3 Nomor 1 Jan-Jun (2026) E-ISSN 3064-3031

- Suprpto, M., dan Harahap, N. (2024). "Desain Materi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam." *An-Nahdlah: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(1).
- Ulhaq, M., & Inayati, F. (2025). "Hubungan Konsep Pendidikan Islam Ibnu Miskawaih dan Al-Ghazali serta Relevansinya terhadap Pendidikan Islam Kontemporer." *Jurnal Kajian Pendidikan Islam*, 4(2).
- Zuhro, I. N., dkk. (2022). "Desain Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam dengan Model ADDIE." *Ta'lim: Jurnal Studi Pendidikan Islam*, 5(2).